REQUEST FOR PROPOSAL #13-049
THIRD PARTY CLAIMS ADMINISTRATION SERVICES
EVALUATION OF PROPOSALS

Evaluation Criteria	AS&G Proposal	Proposal 2	Proposal 3	Proposal 4
Responsiveness to the Request for Proposal (20 points): * Requested information included and thoroughness of response * Understanding and acceptance of the scope of services. * Acceptance of the RFP and Contract requirements * Clarity and conciseness of the response	20 *Proposal Complete and Responsive *Contract Terms accepted	12 *Failed to complete required RFP documents *Lack of clarity *Submitted company contract in lieu of City's standard form	15 *Failed to complete required RFP documents *Lack of clarity	10 *Fee Schedule incomplete *Additional costs not defined *Submitted Oklahoma workers' comp claims procedures
Proposer's capability to provide the services requested (60 points): * Background of proposer and support personnel, including professional qualifications. * Relevant experience of the proposer. * Specific experience with public entity clients, especially municipalities. * Other resources, including the total number of employees, number and location of officers. * References and experience in the Texas public sector,	60 *Most advantageous claims handling procedures *Good adjuster qualifications *Texas public entity accounts *All services provided from Houston office *Good references	50 *Good adjuster qualifications *Texas public entity accounts * Assigned staff divided between 4 offices in 4 different locations (WC adjuster in San Antonio, Liability adjuster in Austin, account supervisor in Houston, account manager in Fort Worth)	35 *Minimal Texas public entity accounts – only one municipality *Helotes office (proximity) *Minimal adjuster qualification provided or defined – service capability unknown	35 *Minimal Liability adjuster experience *Tyler office (proximity) *High adjuster turnover *Texas public entity accounts predominately school districts
Economic Evaluation of proposed Fee Schedule (20 points)	12	18	20	5
Total Points	92	80	70	50
Proposal Ranking	1	2	3	4

REQUEST FOR PROPOSAL #13-049

TOTAL ANNUAL PRICE COMPARISON

	AS&G Proposal	Proposal 2	Proposal 3	Proposal 4
Flat Fee Basis:				
Flat annual claims administration fee	$44,600	$33,300	$35,460	Only Quoted Fee per File
Medical Cost Containment comparable [1]	$17,328	$21,339	$17,774	Only Quoted Fee per File
Total Flat Annual Fee with estimated Medical Cost Containment	$61,928	$54,639	$53,234	Only Quoted Fee per File
Fee Per File Basis:				
Workers' Comp Fee per File comparable [1]	Only Quoted Flat Fee	$24.240	$29,070	$33,165
Liability Fee per File comparable [1]	Only Quoted Flat Fee	$15,660	$15,300	$12,050
Total annual Fee per File comparable [1]	Only Quoted Flat Fee	$39,900	$44,370	$45,215
Medical Cost Containment comparable [1]	Only Quoted Flat Fee	$21,339	$17,774	$21,765
Total estimated Fee per File with estimated Medical Cost Containment	Only Quoted Flat Fee	$61,239	$62,144	$66,980
Notes	All fees included or defined as applicable	3% increase in fees in year three	All fees included or defined as applicable	Additional fees not included or defined
Ranking	3	2	1	4

[1] Comparable calculated on number of claims/services projected based on history

MEDICAL COST CONTAINMNET PRICING

	AS&G	Proposal 2	Proposal 3	Proposal 4
Bill Review/per bill	$6.50	$8.95	$6.75	$7.50 + 25% of savings for negotiated bills [2]
Pre-Authorization – Nurse	$95.00	$90.00	$95.00	$150.00
Pre-Authorization – Physician	$180.00	$160.00	$180.00	$150.00
Case Management (hourly rates)	$75.00	$95.00	$75.00	$88.00
Independent Medical Exam (per exam set up fee)	$250.00	$200.00	$250.00	$650
Concurrent/Retrospective Review	Included	$245.00	at cost	$250-$650
Pharmacy RX Program	Included	Included	Included	9% of savings [2]
Ranking	1	3	2	4

[2] Significant additional costs